Meeting Minutes 7 August 2019

Kantara FI-WG Teleconference

Approved on 2019-07-21 call

Date and Time

- **Date:** Wednesday, August 7, 2019
- **Time:** 16:30 EDT

Attendees

- Wessel, Keith (v)
- Roy, Nicholas (v)
- Bush, Judith (v)
- Cantor, Scott (v)
- Morgan, Andrew (v)
- Goodman, Eric
- Hoehn, Walter (v)
- Wallis, Colin

Agenda

1. Roll call (QV group participation agreement)
2. Agenda bash
3. Approval of 7/17 meeting minutes
4. Review of previous AIs:
   a. Walter: formatting revisions: https://github.com/KantaraInitiative/SAMLprofiles/pull/136
   b. Nick's AI to update the disposition column on the feedback page: https://kantarainitiative.org/confluence/x/6IDJBg
   c. A couple of the items marked as accepted in the disposition column are waiting for revisions from Scott
      i. Issues 5 and 6 are done - email from Scott on July 23
   d. Rainer provided clarification on his feedback on SDP-SP23 in an email to the list dated 27 July
5. Review of outstanding issues in Github
6. Any further work needed on feedback received so far

Minutes

1. Roll call (QV group participation agreement)
   a. Quorum achieved
2. Agenda bash
3. Administrivia: Colin mentioned that the work of this group is going to be noted in the Director's Corner email and tweeted out later today
4. Approval of 7/17 meeting minutes
   a. Judith motions to approve
   b. Walter seconds motion
   c. No opposition
   d. Minutes approved
5. Review of previous AIs:
   a. Diffed the formatting of the implementation and deployment profiles, referred to Kantara formatting guide
   b. Larger questions came up:
      i. Recommendation: Use the first paragraph as the abstract. Start the introduction after that.
      ii. AI: Walter will do this
      i. Link: https://kantarainitiative.github.io/SAMLprofiles/saml2int.html
      ii. AI: Walter will add this as the location, we'll use this until we get the final location just prior to approved publication
      i. Group should pick one of the four Kantara-approved IP agreements
      ii. No reason we have to stick to what's on the doc right now
      iii. Probably the newest version of the CC share-alike attribution license would be the right way to go.
         1. https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/
      iv. AI: Walter will update accordingly - to cc-by-sa-4.0
      i. Scott is in favor of what's there, or strike the Internet2 part, so just "copyright by its respective contributors, used under license"
      ii. AI: Walter to change to this
      i. Walter suggests:
         1. Remove the ORCID
         2. Add the current authors to the top
         3. Put the legacy authors in an appendix
      ii. Scott suggests:
         1. All authors in the appendix
         2. Keith and Nick agree
      iii. No opposition to putting all authors in an appendix, it's effectively what we have now. Just reference "see appendix" in the contributors section at the top.
      iv. Judith notes that a paragraph of names at the beginning isn't unusual in academia

     v. Keith suggests names/orgs of current contributors at the top of the doc. The appendix repeats that with orcids and email addresses at the end.
     vi. Walter suggests removing email addresses.
     vii. Keith says: Remove ORCID, email address, leave current and previous contributors at the top
         1. AI: Walter to do
     i. SAML v2.0 Deployment Profile for Federation Interoperability
     ii. The group thinks these need to match
     iii. Thank you Walter!
     iv. AI: Walter rearrange to make these match
     i. If we made the notation and terminology sections as they are in the implementation profile, then all these would align across docs. Small amount of work to make this really clean.
         1. AI: Walter align
     ii. Section titles:
         1. AI: Walter to do
         1. Change IdP and SP to be Identity Provider and Service Provider.
     iii. Only use IdP/SP abbreviations in non-normative sections
         1. The sense is that the document contains a bit too many IdPs and SPs mentions to make it read well if they are all expanded.
     iv. There is a normative references section and a non-normative references section. Is this necessary?
         1. Yes, keeping them separate is necessary.
         2. Could be two subsections.
         3. AI: Walter to break this into two sub-sections under a references section.
     i. There is now a blank Abstract section that must be populated.
     ii. A blank Location section has been added. This will change just prior to final approval, but I think for now this should be pointed to the current location of the auto-rendered version, if there is such a thing.
     iii. Please note that I changed the CC license to the same as the IP-FI. This may not be what everyone wants, but the Kantara boilerplate contains a list of "approved" licenses. I'm not sure what the process would be to use another, if that is desired.
     iv. Is the copyright correct?
     v. Kantara requires a Contributors section on the "first page." Rendering what we have now at the top looks to me like a big mess. For the IP-FI, we pared the information down quite a bit, which is what I'd recommend. Other alternatives allowed by the Kantara boilerplate are to have the Contributors section link to the WG "Group Roster" page or to reference an appendix. I don't favor these approaches, although the appendix might be a reasonable solution for contributors to the old version.
     vi. I/we need to figure out why asciidoctor is rendering the contributors section(s) inside the "ul" div, making the heading appear red and too small.
     vii. Title discrepancy between implementation and deployment profiles. Words are flipped around. Seems less clear that they are peer documents meant to be used in tandem.
     viii. Other things we could do to make these easier to read together
  a. Walter: formatting revisions: https://github.com/KantaraInitiative/SAMLprofiles/pull/136
  b. Walter should delete the old PR and just merge to master.

Next Meeting

- **Date:** Weds, Aug 7, 2019
- **Time:** *16:30 EDT*
- **Code:** https://global.gotomeeting.com/join/110596309
- You can also dial in using your phone.

United States: +1 (669) 224-3318

Access Code: 110-596-309

More phone numbers

Australia: +61 2 8355 1038

Austria: +43 1 2530 22500

Belgium: +32 28 93 7002

Canada: +1 (647) 497-9380

Denmark: +45 32 72 03 69

Finland: +358 923 17 0556

France: +33 170 950 590

Germany: +49 692 5736 7300

Ireland: +353 15 360 756

Italy: +39 0 230 57 81 80

Netherlands: +31 207 941 375

New Zealand: +64 9 282 9510

Norway: +47 21 93 37 37

Spain: +34 932 75 1230

Sweden: +46 853 527 818

Switzerland: +41 225 4599 60

United Kingdom: +44 330 221 0097

NOTE: *Do not follow the code with a "#" symbol as it may cause the code not to be recognized.*